

October 28, 2016

Ms. Lynne Serpe, National Election Supervisor Pacifica Foundation 1925 Martin Luther King Jr. Way Berkeley, CA 94704

> Re: Addendum to Certificate of Result for: Pacifica Foundation Local Station Board Elections (TBI Elections 0731601/3671601/3671602/3671603/3671604/3671605)

Dear Ms. Serpe:

Following my certification of the results of the Pacifica elections on October 20, you asked me to provide additional analysis and reports regarding write-ins for the 10 elections. In the initial certification, only the writeins for the WPFW Listener election had received detailed scrutiny because only these write-ins directly affected the results of the election (i.e. "write-in aggregate" placed within the "elected" group for that election). However, the because the Foundation uses write-in data as part of its recruitment of replacement information, you asked for more detailed write-in data. This letter and the attachments to it provide that data.

The two types of analysis undertaken are as follows:

In three specific cases, because of their large number of write-in mentions, a write-in candidate has been fully disaggregated from the "write-in (aggregate)" count: Ahmad Anderson at KPFA, Jaime Rodriguez at KPFT, and Ebon Charles at WBAI. It was already known that none of these candidates could have finished in the top nine, but it was not known when they were eliminated in the STV count. That analysis has now been done and is attached.

In all other cases, the number of write-in mentions is far too small to have any effect on the count at all. For all these cases, all names written in on any ballot, paper or electronic, have been listed, along with their number of mentions and the rankings of their mentions. These lists are also attached to this document.

With Ahmad Anderson and Ebon Charles, disaggregating them from the count had no effect on the order in which candidates were elected to the Board. This was not the case with Jaime Rodriguez at KPFT. Because of this, in request to your request, I provide the following additional analysis:

First, no ballots were added or subtracted from the set of ballots counted between the original, certified count and the recount with this name disaggregated. Additionally, no STV strings were reinterpreted. The new count is based on the identical ballots and the identical interpretation of those ballots as the earlier count. Election Services and Solutions

Second, although the individuals who are elected to the KPFT station board are identical from the first count to the more recent count, the order in which they were elected – that is, the order in which they reached the threshold of voters necessary to be elected – changed. It is important to understand what this means and what this doesn't mean.

In an STV election, one is elected when one has achieved a certain threshold of votes. This order is not determined by how many votes the individual receives – someone who has been elected earlier is not more popular, or the recipient of more votes, than someone who is elected later. That person merely reached a threshold earlier. Thus the order in which ballots are counted has a deceptive effect on what people assume is the "result": it appears that being elected is meaningful, when it might mean no more than that the pile of ballots was stacked in a manner that by coincidence allowed on candidate to reach the threshold before another.

In the case of the 2016 KPFT election, if write-ins are fully aggregated, three candidates are elected fifth, sixth, and seventh as follows:

Casenave, 18<sup>th</sup> round [5<sup>th</sup> person elected] Conkling, 20<sup>th</sup> round [tie 6<sup>th</sup> person elected] Williams, 20<sup>th</sup> round [tie 6<sup>th</sup> person elected]

If Jaime Rodriguez is disaggregated, they are elected as follows:

Conkling, 20<sup>th</sup> round [5<sup>th</sup> person elected] Williams, 22<sup>nd</sup> round [tie 6<sup>th</sup> person elected] Casenave, 22<sup>nd</sup> round [tie 6<sup>th</sup> person elected]

This makes it look like the "results" have "changed." But all that has happened is that the same ballots have been counted in a different order. How does this happen?

If you look at the 17<sup>th</sup> round results of each version of the election count, you see that the three candidates appear in the same order and have very similar vote totals. (They are not identical because the smaller number of aggregated write-ins have already been distributed; but this has had very little effect on the margins to this point.) In the fully aggregated version of the election, the next person defeated is Don Cook, whose 60.376 votes are redistributed as follows:

Casenave 19.324 Williams 8.167 Conkling 5.141 [The remainder goes to other candidates or the exhausted pile.]

This is enough to confirm a margin for Casenave over Williams and Conklin, and elect her in the 18<sup>th</sup> round.



In the version of the election that disaggregates Jaime Rodriguez, the next person (after the 17<sup>th</sup> round) defeated is Jaime Rodriguez. Rodriguez's 53.525 votes are redistributed as follows:

Conkling 30.650 Williams 7.138 Casenave 1.000 [The remainder goes to other candidates or the exhausted pile.]

This is enough to flip the order of these three candidates long enough for Conkling to become elected prior to Casenave.

In the disaggregated version of the count, when Jaime Rodriguez is defeated, all write-in votes have been redistributed. In the aggregated version, when Cook has been defeated, no write-in votes have yet been redistributed, thus creating the appearance of a "different" result. However, in the aggregated version, once the write-in votes are defeated and redistributed, the same ballots have been counted in the same way, leading to what is in fact the same result.

So long as the write-ins were eventually redistributed, they would eventually lead to the same result. Had the write-ins never been redistributed - i.e. because they finished #9 - we would not have this problem because we would have had to disaggregate them simply to declare the ninth winners. If the write-ins distributed in two different manners, from one count to another, they can change the sequence in which the other candidates ranked on those ballots receive their votes, but not whether they eventually receive their votes and are elected.

Respectfully submitted, TrueBallot, Inc.

By: Kenneth Mostern, Vice President for Western US Operations

## **KPFA Listener Sponsor Delegate Election**

#### <u>Start 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 Final</u> << Previous Count

# COUNT 16 -- Ahmad Anderson (write-in) has been DEFEATED -- transferring all votes.

CANDIDATE	THIS ROUND	TOTAL	STATUS
Carole Travis	0	241	ELECTED 1st count
Aki Tanaka	0	241	ELECTED 1st count
Andrea J. Turner	0	241	ELECTED 2nd count
T.M. Scruggs	0	241	ELECTED 9th count
Carol Wolfley	0	241	ELECTED 9th count
Christina Huggins	0	241	ELECTED 12th count
Brian Crowell	0	241	ELECTED 12th count
Craig Williams	0	241	ELECTED 14th count
Tom Voorhees	+7.64857	237.50204	ELECTED 16th count
Ahmad Anderson (write	-217.58147	0	DEFEATED 15th count
Chris Cory	0	0	DEFEATED 11th count
Marilla Arguelles	0	0	DEFEATED 8th count
Kris Stewart	0	0	DEFEATED 7th count
Ramses Teon Nichols	0	0	DEFEATED 6th count
LaTasha Monique Warmsl.	0	0	DEFEATED 5th count
Write-in (aggregate)	0	0	DEFEATED 4th count
Yuri Gottesman	0	0	EXCLUDED
EXHAUSTED PILE:	+209.9329	240.49796	
TOTALS:	0	2406	
Tom Voorhees has been ELI	ECTED, by the	process of e	elimination.
<< Previous Count			

Friday, October 21, 2016 11:40 AM ChoicePlus Pro -- Version 2.3.4 (c) 1993-2009 Voting Solutions -- All Rights Reserved Voting Solutions Web Site

KPFA-L aggregated write-ins		
Name	# of mentions	Rankings
Cynthia Johnson	1	9
Dave Heller	1	1
Davey D	1	9
Dennis Bernstein	1	1
Jessie Ventura	1	5
Josiah Alderete	3	8,5,4
Kate Raphael	6	8,4,3,15,3,1
Ken & Janie Wong	1	1
Lisa Dettmer	1	5
Lynn Orlando	1	10
Michael J. Sukhov	1	9
Michael Parenti	3	5,1,1
Nanci Armstrong	1	8
nobody	1	9
Onana Supoaco	1	4
Rainer Wachacovsky	1	1
Richard Wolinsky	1	2
Robert Reich	1	9
Stacy Scott	1	11
Steve Seltzer	2	6,6
Steve Zeltzer	2	11,1

KPFA-S aggregated v	write-ins			
Name	Mentions		Ranking	
Ann Garrison		2	5, 3	
Dennis Roos jr		1	6	
Luis Medina		1	3	
Phil Osegueda		1	4	
Philip Maldari		2	4, 5	
rames-teon-leon		1	4	

Name	Mentions	Rankings
Alan Minsky	1	1
Ali Lexa	4	1,2,17,17
Buzz Mansur	1	1
Chrisanne Eastwood	1	1
Cohen Johnson	1	2
Don White	1	1
Dorothy Raik	1	15
Erik Hines	1	17
Ian Masters	2	1, 1
Jessica Andrea Spencer	1	3
Kevin Breslin	1	10
Lance Simmons	1	2
M. Bond	1	2
Mariella Saba	1	1
Marlena Bond	2	17,6
Michael Novick	1	5
Nick Macias	1	1
none of the above	1	1
Paulina Vasiliev	6	2, 16, 6, 8, 9, 9
Randy Koppang	1	1
Ricardo Hernandez	1	7
Roger Zimmerman	1	16
Rolando Salmaron	1	11
Roy Tuckman	1	1
Steve Pride	1	17
Steve Weatherwax	5	1, 10, 10, 11, 10
Sue Cohen-Johnson	2	8, 18
Ted Hajjari	1	2
Tej Grewall	1	1
Wendy Lofland	1	3

KPFK-S write-ins Name	Mentions	Rankings
Chavonne Taylor	1	3
Doug Kriegel	1	2
Jaime Gomez	1	1
Mark Maxwell	1	6
Paul Song	1	6
Teddy Robinson	1	6
Tej Grewall	28	3, 3, 1, 3, 3, 1, 1, 5, 6, 3, 4, 1, 4, 3, 3, 4, 3, 3, 3, 2, 3, 3, 3, 3, 3, 3, 3, 3
Will Ryan	1	1

NOTE: Tej Grewal had only four first place votes and would still be defeated first round

# **KPFT Listener Sponsor Delegate Election**

#### <u>Start 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 Final</u> << Previous Count

## **COUNT 23 -- Adriana Casenave has been ELECTED -- transferring surplus votes.**

CANDIDATE	THIS ROUND	TOTAL	STATUS
Robert L. Mark	0	85	ELECTED 1st count
Elaine M. Duncan	0	85	ELECTED 10th count
Perry `P.K.` McCary	0	85	ELECTED 13th count
Jim Krafka	0	85	ELECTED 17th count
Di Conkling	0	85	ELECTED 19th count
Vaniecia J. Williams	0	85	ELECTED 20th count
Adriana Casenave	-16.46395	85	ELECTED 22nd count
Alexandra `Catherine` .	0	93.56058	ELECTED 22nd count
K.C. Sinclair	+4.15793	88.09733	ELECTED 23rd count
Don Cook	0	0	DEFEATED 21st count
Jaime Rodriguez	0	0	DEFEATED 18th count
Richard Hyde	0	0	DEFEATED 16th count
Adrienne LaViolette	0	0	DEFEATED 15th count
Nicolas Economidis	0	0	DEFEATED 14th count
DeWayne Lark	0	0	DEFEATED 12th count
Rita Washington	0	0	DEFEATED 11th count
Rick Potthoff	0	0	DEFEATED 9th count
Matthew Moore	0	0	DEFEATED 8th count
Georgia D. Provost	0	0	DEFEATED 7th count
Todd Buehlman	0	0	DEFEATED 6th count
Write-in (aggregate)	0	0	DEFEATED 5th count
Nancy Saibara-Naritomi	0	0	DEFEATED 4th count
Alan Alan Apurim	0	0	DEFEATED 3rd count
Wesley Bethune	0	0	DEFEATED 2nd count
Benjamin Perodeau	0	0	DEFEATED 2nd count
Rizwan A. Raja	0	0	EXCLUDED
Yahconnon	0	0	EXCLUDED
Lauren E. Haydu	0	0	EXCLUDED
EXHAUSTED PILE:	+12.30602	64.34209	
TOTALS:	0	841	
K.C. Sinclair has been EL	ECTED becau	se s/he has	s met the quota.
< Previous Count			

Sunday, October 23, 2016 11:03 AM ChoicePlus Pro -- Version 2.3.4 (c) 1993-2009 Voting Solutions -- All Rights Reserved Voting Solutions Web Site

KPFT-L write-ins not disaggregated	l		
Name	mentions	rankings	
Dennis Simshaeuser	1		6
Eddie Kerley	1		4
Edwin Johnston	1		1
Egberto Willies	3	11,11,11	
Hank Lamb	4	1, 1, 15, 2	
Jeffrey Thames	1		1
Joe Davis	1		6
John LaBonte	1		12
Joseph Davis	4	1, 12, 10, 8	
Lars Headington	2	1, 1	
Marietta Roebuck	4	1, 9, 11, 6	
Michael Roebuck	2	1, 6	
Paul A. Colby	1		3
Rhonda Garner	3	6, 1, 6	
Roark Smith	2	1, 1	
Wally James	7	12, 2, 1, 13	, 2, 4, 1

KPFK-S write-ins			
Name	Mentions	Ranking	
Akua Holt		1	3
Anthony Cox		1	10
Christopher Whaley		1	2
Jaime Rodriguez		1	1
Nick Economidis		1	1
Patrick Hoyt		1	4
Rick Heysquierdo		1	5

# **KPFT Listener Sponsor Delegate Election**

#### <u>Start 1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 Final</u> << Previous Count

## **COUNT 23 -- Adriana Casenave has been ELECTED -- transferring surplus votes.**

CANDIDATE	THIS ROUND	TOTAL	STATUS
Robert L. Mark	0	85	ELECTED 1st count
Elaine M. Duncan	0	85	ELECTED 10th count
Perry `P.K.` McCary	0	85	ELECTED 13th count
Jim Krafka	0	85	ELECTED 17th count
Di Conkling	0	85	ELECTED 19th count
Vaniecia J. Williams	0	85	ELECTED 20th count
Adriana Casenave	-16.46395	85	ELECTED 22nd count
Alexandra `Catherine` .	0	93.56058	ELECTED 22nd count
K.C. Sinclair	+4.15793	88.09733	ELECTED 23rd count
Don Cook	0	0	DEFEATED 21st count
Jaime Rodriguez	0	0	DEFEATED 18th count
Richard Hyde	0	0	DEFEATED 16th count
Adrienne LaViolette	0	0	DEFEATED 15th count
Nicolas Economidis	0	0	DEFEATED 14th count
DeWayne Lark	0	0	DEFEATED 12th count
Rita Washington	0	0	DEFEATED 11th count
Rick Potthoff	0	0	DEFEATED 9th count
Matthew Moore	0	0	DEFEATED 8th count
Georgia D. Provost	0	0	DEFEATED 7th count
Todd Buehlman	0	0	DEFEATED 6th count
Write-in (aggregate)	0	0	DEFEATED 5th count
Nancy Saibara-Naritomi	0	0	DEFEATED 4th count
Alan Alan Apurim	0	0	DEFEATED 3rd count
Wesley Bethune	0	0	DEFEATED 2nd count
Benjamin Perodeau	0	0	DEFEATED 2nd count
Rizwan A. Raja	0	0	EXCLUDED
Yahconnon	0	0	EXCLUDED
Lauren E. Haydu	0	0	EXCLUDED
EXHAUSTED PILE:	+12.30602	64.34209	
TOTALS:	0	841	
K.C. Sinclair has been EL	ECTED becau	se s/he has	s met the quota.
< Previous Count			

Sunday, October 23, 2016 11:03 AM ChoicePlus Pro -- Version 2.3.4 (c) 1993-2009 Voting Solutions -- All Rights Reserved Voting Solutions Web Site

Name	Mentions	Rankings	
Bernard White	1		6
Betty Dopson	1		2
Bob Lederer	1		8
David Salay	2	3, 1	
Gary Null	6	1, 1, 1, 1, 2, 1	
John Riley	1		8
Kathryn Davis	1		1
Kevin Keating	4	2,7,7,9	
Lynn Stewart	2	1, 9	
Max Schmidt	1		1
Mitchel Cohen	3	5, 5, 2	
Randy A. Credico	1		10
Reggie Johnson	2	1, 1	
Richard Wolff	1		1
Thomas Barton	6	7, 7, 7, 1, 7, 8	
Wuji Jacobs	1		3

6
2
4
4

WPFW-S write-ins				
Name	Mentions		Ranking	
Robyn Holden		1		3
Eileen Rosen		1		2
Esther Iverem		2	1, 2	
Arthur McCloud		1		2
Meredith Cordisco		1		3